

## Paradise Lake Improvement Board Minutes – 7-13-11

1. Meeting called to order at 7:00 pm. All present.
2. Motion to approve the minutes from the June meeting. Arden motioned, Cathy seconded. Motion carried.
3. Public Comment
  - a. Rosemary Consoni and the FoPL had forwarded a letter to Jim Tamlyn and Paul Teike concerning their contributing towards a test aeration area in the western basin of the lake. The question of whether we received it was asked and also a question was raised as to why it was not on the agenda. Answer: Jim and Paul received the letter, however, they are not in charge of the agenda and the letter did not get passed to the other 3 board members. [Note: Items that community residents want placed on the agenda must be sent to [paradiselib@gmail.com](mailto:paradiselib@gmail.com)]
4. Chair Report – none
5. Appearances – Tony Groves, John Tucci
  - a. Tony came in with an update on the potential SAD map that is now color-coded based on what type of parcel is held. There was further discussion on the draft SAD criteria and it was decided that a Board member should notify the township assessor of our SAD plans now to give him a chance to prepare.
  - b. Tony also handed out a vegetation summary worksheet and a grid map of the milfoil in the lake which lead to a discussion on the actual acres effected. According to the handout, Paradise Lake has approximately 700 acres of milfoil however; the calculation in percentage done by DEQ standards was only 15%. Tony was asked to put this calculation to paper so that it would be less confusing for all involved, as 15% does not equal 700 acres.
  - c. Tony also commented on the oxygen levels of the lake having tested at all times of the day as well as various depths. His conclusion is that our lake is very well oxygenated which rendered the idea of using aeration as a method of control in our lake without merit in his opinion. Tony presented 3 studies to back his theory including one that utilized multiple lakes over an 8-year period. The end result was that there are no controlled studies that conclude that aeration reduces milfoil or sediment and he will not recommend this option. He spoke further on the historic use of aeration, discussed more about how it worked and looked at some recent studies to determine feasibility.

- d. Comment by Arden – The SAD is the most important part of this project and no mistakes can be made.
- e. Comment by Chairman Jim – We need the SAD set up before residents leave for the summer. He also spoke briefly about the criteria and the cost of aeration. Tony and Jim concluded that a special meeting must be set up in July to further discuss the parameters of the SAD which would give the Board the opportunity to accept the preliminary plan and within one month, possibly approve the criteria by vote. Tony will also have specific numbers and costs outlined for this special meeting and will also have information to hand out to the audience.
- f. Paul commented that we need to accept the draft SAD criteria so that we can begin working from that point. Elaine commented that perhaps we should wait to see what the costs would be per individual before accepting.
- g. Arden asked how we might proceed with the Hebron Township portion of the lake since they chose not to take part in our mission. Tony commented that we could ask them for an assessment-at-large.
- h. Elaine asked if we can legally treat their portion of the lake. Tony answered that we could biologically but had reservations about chemicals. He also felt that there might be some potential ways in which to have Hebron okay any treatment.
- i. Arden stated that he believes we need to treat the entire lake and feels his job as a Board member is to address the needs of the whole lake including Hebron. Elaine commented that she understood Arden's viewpoint, however, Elaine asked Tony to provide an individual cost including paying for Hebron Township and an individual cost without paying for Hebron Township. Arden disagreed that cost should be a considered over and above the mission of fixing the entire lake. Elaine stated that with all due respect, Arden does not have to pay for it and believes cost is a major determining factor overall for the people who have to foot the bill.
- j. Chairman Jim reiterated that in two weeks we will have a SAD map and proposal of cost, Tony agreed.
- k. The Board determined that the first public hearing could be on August 31. This hearing would be to announce the scope of the project. If the Board votes to move forward with said plans, the project would be a go. The next public hearing will be to finalize the SAD and would take place on July 27 with the next regular meetings scheduled for August 9. Public Hearing notices will be completed and posted accordingly. It was deemed that the Public Hearing will be at Mackinaw High School to allow for more attendance.
- l. John Tucci also spoke in defense of his aeration proposal. He feels that there is current research that shows the benefits of aeration although he admits that there is not 100% proof that it would work however, there is not proof that it wouldn't work either. He stated that he backs his opinion in capital and that they had systems currently operating that will show evidence of milfoil reduction and sediment reduction in other lakes.

- m. Question – Cathy: Your study on Indian lake shows a 50% reduction in milfoil. Is that in acres or is that a percentage? Answer (John) – Percentage of coverage.
6. Old Business
- a. Paul stated that the Township Board would accept an assessment-at-large at this time.
7. New Business – None
8. Financial Report given by Cathy. Paul motioned that we pay bills for June, Arden seconded. Roll call vote unanimous. Motion carried.
9. Public Comment
- a. Audience member - How many people are at this meeting? Quick count revealed approximately 45 residents.
  - b. Audience member - How much chemical would be used to treat the lake? Answer (Tony): At the next meeting I will have a more specific answer.
  - c. Marilyn Smith – I don't understand how you arrived at 700 acres of coverage if you are saying that the coverage in percentage is only 15%. (Bob Roll and others mentioned their agreement). Answer (Tony): The percentage is done by DEQ standards. Jim asked Tony to put it all on paper so that everyone could understand this count. Tony agreed.
  - d. Marilyn Smith – Tony, you said that we would have different options to choose from but are planning on just quoting for a chemical/weevil solution. That is only one option. What about a dash boat? Answer (Tony): That option would be way too expensive and you have too much coverage to consider that.
  - e. Dick Moster – offered congrats to the Board and asked if the assessment would be lower if the Twp. joins the SAD. Answer – Yes. Mr. Moster continued on to say that the west bay is full of weeds.
  - f. Audience member – If we treat the lake, who takes care of the downed weeds on shore? Answer (Tony) – Treated weeds sink. There should not be much on shore.
  - g. Ann Klebba – Will you treat within 250 ft from shore? Answer (Tony): We would treat in that area but with an appropriate chemical. Ann responded that she would not be on board with using any chemicals that close to shore out of concern for her water well.
  - h. Ann Klebba – What was the cost of the pilot aeration project? Tony answered that the cost would be approximately 197,000 per year over 10 years.
  - i. Audience member – Thank you Tony for using peer-reviewed studies. Tony mentioned that this is very important and that the Board should remove one item from the website that has no scientific backing and is not peer-reviewed.

- j. Audience member – How long do chemicals stay in the lake? Answer (Tony): They do not stay in the lake permanently but will break down in time. Audience member continued questioning how we were going to keep the chemicals from washing over into Mud Creek and finally into Cecil Bay? Tony answered that that probably would not happen. Audience member said that if we have a bad storm, it most certainly will.
- k. Audience member – Will the Twp help with the cost? Answer (Paul): Yes.
- l. Audience member – As for people coming to the meetings and saying that they heard negative comments about us down state and that we now have a bad reputation and that we are a joke, I don't see it and I think the community is coming together more. Answer (Arden): It is not the Board that is being discussed as a joke in many circles throughout Michigan, it is some community residents public reaction to the current state of the lake and the treatment they are lobbying for.
- m. Bob Roll – If you treat 700 acres, what will that do to the oxygen level in the lake? Answer (Tony): The herbicides we would use work slow so it will take time to kill the weeds. This does not cause an oxygen problem. Bob continued asking if these herbicides will kill other plants that are good plants. Answer (Tony): There will be some other plant kills but it should be minimal.
- n. At this point there was again some discussion on how 700 acres = 15%.
- o. Bill Mummert – Why does milfoil like Paradise Lake in particular? Answer (Tony): Shallow lakes provide a good nutrient base. Elaine added that there is a USGS map available on the PLIB website which shows that milfoil is a nuisance all across the country in nearly every state and that our lake is just one of a multitude. It is everywhere.
- p. Audience member – How do faulty septic systems contribute to the weed problem? Answer (Tony): It does not help but it isn't a major problem.
- q. Bob Smith – 40 hrs. does not seem like enough time to do a weed study. Answer (Tony): We do these all the time and can get them done quickly.
- r. Rosemary Consoni – The FoPL would like to announce that there is a fried chicken dinner at the marina on July 17 from 11-5:00. Everyone is invited.
- s. Audience member – Where do chemicals go after they are put in the lake? Answer (Tony): They degrade and then photo degrade.
- t. Marilyn Roll – Parcels with multiple buildings or multiple residents should not be charged more units of benefit in the SAD

Meeting Adjourned