

PLIB Regular Meeting 8-9-11

All Present

Motion by Cathy to accept minutes for special July meeting and July regular meeting.
Motion seconded by Arden. Motion carried.

Public comment –

Diane Nimsick read a letter from James Sullivan that concerned a rescue on the lake in which the sheriff deputy was stranded in the weeds and had to get help.

Rosemary Consani – concerning the meeting with Hebron Township. She handed out an overview on the meeting proceedings and discussed the results that Hebron had no desire to be a part of the Lake Board.

Arden discussed that Riparian's own property to the center of the lake; not just the shore.

Audience member – Asked if Hebron Twp residents can contribute to the project and said that some would. This board needs to follow recommendations of the professional.

Audience member – We were told it would cost \$500,000 to fix the lake. He has no problem with that, but thinks that septic systems need to be addressed and doesn't like the idea of spending money on weevils.

Tom Walton – I was one of the people who helped the deputy. I am worried that someone is going to drown.

John Beeson – According to the sheriff deputy there will be no boats on the lake for rescues.

Chairman Jim – I have spoken personally with the sheriff and he said there won't be any jet skis, but there will be an airboat.

Tony Groves – Last meeting I gave the board a science study that shows impact of Fluridone. Also studies from MSU and a fact sheet on safety.

Elaine – The study you presented had no author; can you tell me who wrote it?

Tony – I think C Pro Corp.

Tony – In past meetings we spoke of different aspects of the lake. Different treatments were discussed. Most were not good alternatives. Either because of the cost or of the permit process. That left us with options 1 and 2.

Discussion of options 1 and 2 and what it covered. There was also discussion on the permit process. If Hebron Twp. does not sponsor the project then option 1 is off the table. Option 2 has been modified to eliminate 2,4-d in any form since there is danger in getting into wells. If option 2 is used then Hebron twp. will not be treated.. The board needs to accept a tentative plan so we can move forward with a public hearing. If Hebron Twp. will not sponsor us, our assessment will rise by 15%.

Elaine – If we move ahead with this option it will cost us \$725,000 with only a 50% warranty.

Tony talked about warranties and how it worked concerning the lake.

Discussion on weevils and how we monitor their progress and if they are working.

Arden – We've spent all our time discussing Fluridone and now that they may be off the table, we need to take the time to take a close look at Triclopyr. Originally, it was 2 4-D and there were a number of people that were okay with that, then it was Fluridone and these same people were okay with that. Now it's Triclopyr and they are okay with that but we can't just be okay with that. We have a responsibility to actually look into this chemical to see if it's safe and we need the time to do that.

Chairman Jim – Discussed phone call he had from a Lake Improvement board member in Indian Lake who told him how well aeration was working for them.

Tony – I have not seen a study that shows that aeration works.

Elaine – Will the water become cloudy?

Tony – With herbicides proposed in options 1 and 2 the work is slow, so this happens over a period of weeks so it can't cloud the water. We have used Fluridone in over 100 lake treatments and have not seen algae blooms or fish kill.

Elaine – Tony, you have gone to great lengths to provide us with nothing but “cons” in regard to every treatment option other than chemicals. I have a problem with the fact that you have only provided us with the “pros” of chemical use. Surely, it is not perfect so I would like you to talk about the draw backs of this option.

Tony – If the products are used at the labeled rate they are safe. The downside is the concerns of the public. I think they are effective.

Elaine – That's fine but again, you are not talking about specific cons. What about the fact that this treatment is incredibly expensive yet it is extremely short term? We might get two years for our hundreds of thousands of dollars?

Chairman Jim – After 2 years of treatment have you had luck with biological treatments after that?

Tony – no

Chairman Jim – I keep thinking about Jennifer Jones’s statement that once we start chemicals we’ll never stop.

Cathy – What is the status of Manistee Lake?

Tony – They have had a resurgence of milfoil and we have stocked a lot of weevils. We will know more in the Fall.

Elaine – Canada has had success with weevils. Why is that?

Tony – I haven’t read those studies. In theory weevils look good, but in reality there are variables that need to be considered.

Cathy – Is Triclopyr a spot treatment?

Tony – Yes, we would treat milfoil beds.

Cathy - \$20,000 in your proposal for guide books seems very high. Also would your consultant fee be negotiable?

Tony – My fee would be negotiable.

Arden – There aren’t many Riparian’s in Hebron Twp. We would need their help.

Tony – We have a tentative date for the public hearing, before Labor Day so that we can get the public to attend. We can reschedule this date.

Arden made a motion that Cathy is instructed to call the boards attorney to see what the legalities are in reference to Hebron Twp. sponsoring and if it is possible to hold them harmless against legal action. And that Paul go to the next Hebron meeting to ask again for their support.

Paul seconded the motion

Roll call vote:

Paul – yes

Arden – yes

Cathy – yes with reservation since we have already asked 3 other times and have been refused.

Elaine – No. 4 times is beating a dead horse and I’m afraid it will never end.

Chairman Jim – yes, so we can finally put this to rest.

No finance report

Cathy to Tony – Can you give us an option using weevils first?

Tony – We would need 1,000 weevils per acre. With an initial cost of \$700,000. If it doesn't work you would lose that investment.

Elaine – I have a letter here from the supplier of weevils who knows this lake and gave an estimate that 100,000 weevils were what is necessary to treat the 700 acres and that over a period of 5 years the cost would be between \$93,000 and \$100,000.

Tony – I need to look over those figures.

Chairman Jim – Give us the figures for this option Tony

Tony – yes I can do that

Public Comments

Mary Madigan – The minutes show that Paul was supposed to go to the last Hebron Twp. meeting, but he didn't go.

John Beason – Can you guarantee that weevils will work?

Tony – no

Ann Hayes – Elaine are you from Hebron Twp.?

Elaine – No

Ann – If Hebron Twp. sponsors the project will you choose option 1?

Cathy – all options will be discussed

Bob Roll – Tony, you have given a lot of information on Fluridone. What about Triclopyr? How long does it stay in the water? What about wells? Collateral damage on the native plants? What about the fish?

Rosemary Consani – If this board decides on weevils the FOPL will have their members treat their own properties with herbicides. If anyone needs help with this, see me after the meeting.

Audience member – Tony tell us about Triclopyr

Tony – It has a 1 day swim restriction, no fish restriction and no well restriction.

Marilyn Roll – was at Hebron Twp. meeting and their attorney who was present, stated that holding them harmless is only as good as the paper it's written on since any riparian

in Hebron can sue them and there may not be enough money in the Paradise Lake funds to cover it.

Audience member – In option 1 and 2 you use herbicides for 2 years and then stock weevils for 3 years; is this correct?

Tony – yes

Meeting adjourned.