

PLIB Meeting Minutes – 9/14/11

1. Meeting called to order – all present.
2. Motion to accept minutes by Arden, seconded by Elaine – Motion carried.
3. Chairman began the meeting by reading part of the legal opinion from our attorney concerning Hebron Twp. participation and the authority of the PLIB where this participation is concerned.
4. Public Comment
 - a. Ann Klebba gave a report on the field trip to Indian lake in which several residents and 1 board member attended. [Full report can be viewed on the news page]
 - b. Marilyn Smith offered her support to Ann’s findings. Specifically, she supports biological treatment and she does not feel aeration has been investigated enough. Marilyn went on to state that after 5 years of chemical treatment on Indian Lake, they still have milfoil in the lake. Additionally she was impressed with how little noise came from the compressors powering the system.
5. Correspondence – One email was presented and will be available on the website.
6. Chair Report – None
7. Appearances
 - a. Kira Davis from the Little Traverse Bay Bands of Odawa Indians gave a presentation regarding the new boat wash station that will be coming to Carp Lake shortly. Included in this presentation was a run down on how the grant was secured and where the money came from. The project is a partnership grant between the DNR, the Little Traverse Bay Bands of Odawa Indians and the PLIB. Each partner will have a separate responsibility and will work together on the new project. The PLIB will be responsible for the maintenance and electric. Kira then took questions from the public. The Board thanked Kira for doing a great job and ultimately securing the grant for our lake.
 - b. Tony Groves
 - i. Tony provided a letter to the Board that discussed weevils and what makes them successful. They seem like the perfect solution but there are drawbacks. He also touched on how many weevils would be needed for the project.
 - ii. Comment (Elaine) – There are “drawbacks” to any option we choose. To me, paying over a quarter of a million dollars for a

chemical that is only going to work for 1 or 2 years is a major draw back.

- iii. Since Fluridone is now not an option, Tony presented another option to the Board consisting of chemical treatment in year one and biological treatment (weevils) in years 2-5. There was a brief discussion on the Public Hearing and project approval.
- iv. Tony handed out a study on Triclopyr by the Army Corps of Engineers as he felt that this study might answer some of the questions posed by the Board at the last meeting.
- v. Question (Jim) – How many weevils per acre do we need? Answer (Tony) – 1,000 per acre. Reply (Jim) - [After having done a quick calculation] Jim let it be known that the figure of 1,000 per acre for our lake seemed excessive and went on to say that the amount of weevils used in the study would have calculated to just a few per acre and since that is not near enough, he did not understand the logic in the findings.
- vi. Question (Cathy) – What is the rate of application for Triclopyr? Answer (Tony) – 100 lbs. per acre. Reply (Cathy) – In regards to your weevil count of 1,000 per acre, studies show that we would need far less. Reply (Tony) – That would be a minimum and some areas are thick.
- vii. Question (Cathy) – Is there a study that shows success in regards to a combination treatment of chemicals then weevils. Answer (Tony) – No.
- viii. Comment (Jim) – Studies show that people who work with chemicals have a higher rate of Cancer. Additionally, our attorney’s opinion leads me to believe that the treatment you are proposing will affect Hebron Residents as warned against in the letter. Reply (Tony) – I have been doing this for almost 30 years and have never had a legal issue. This product has been studied and is safe.
- ix. Comment (Elaine) – While I can appreciate the studies and its safety label; how many times has something come to the public market that was thoroughly tested and deemed safe only to be hastily removed from the market thereafter after being proven hazardous or otherwise? How long has Triclopyr been used? Answer (Tony) – About 13 years.
- x. Comment (Jim) – What’s going on at Indian Lake is something I think we need to consider. Reply (Tony) – My team has been on Indian Lake twice. I can’t find studies of projects that show aeration works.
- xi. Comment (Paul) – Jim, will you ask the County to help us with the cost of our project? Reply (Jim) – Yes.
- xii. Comment (Arden) – There are studies of everything out there today. One study will prove on thing and another study will prove the opposite. To me, it’s the people who are paying for it that we

should be listening to. They are the ones who stand to lose if aeration does not work. They aren't applicators or people in the "business" of treatment so they are going to be the most reliable source we have. I think it is important that residents of Indian Lake are behind this. That tells me something and I think we need to take a closer look at this option.

Public Comment

1. Rosemary Consoni - Tony, you did not see Indian Lake. You yourself did not go. It is working there. Reply (Tony) – I need to see studies to make a recommendation. Comment (Ann Klebba) – Tony, if you needed studies, why didn't you tell me that before we went? Every board member along with both lake associations were invited to the Indian Lake field trip. I also extended you an invitation and spoke to you several times and would have gladly brought you anything you requested. Reply (Tony) – I have the data from Indian Lake and it does not show aeration works. Comment (Elaine) -but the residents who are paying for it says it does work.
2. Marilyn – Tony, you cannot possibly be taking reproduction into account in that weevil figure. That is excessive. Also, I don't feel you took a good enough look at Indian Lake.
3. John Beeson – I heard that summer people won't get to vote at the Public Hearing is that true? Answer (Arden) – People need to quit listening to gossip and rumors in this community. Everyone who would have to pay for this has a say although they do not get to vote and it is not Tony who is going to decide this issue, it is the Board's decision.
4. Jim – I think we need to try something other than chemicals. I also want more detailed information on our attorneys' opinion and feel we need more info on what is happening at Indian Lake as well. [Note: Chairman Jim and Elaine may go if their schedule's allow.]
5. Rosemary Consani – Can you publish a financial report? Answer - Yes.
6. Bob Roll – Will the treatment effect Hebron Twp.? Answer (Tony) No, it's a spot treatment.
7. Bob Smith – I'm glad to see that no one voted on the proposed plan. The proposal to fund weevils does not seem to add up. I don't want to see the weevils we now have in the lake disappear.
8. Marilyn Smith - This board should go out on the lake to see the milfoil. Aeration also uses bio-augmentation. Weevils build a population so a large number may not be necessary.

Dick Schweller - Cathy, thank you for pushing tonight. I hope aeration would work, but the board has been in place for 15 months. We need to move for a Spring 2012 treatment. People are affected differently since some fish and use pontoon boats while others use the lake for skiing. If there is not a plan in place for the spring by January, our members are going to treat their own bottomlands. Question (Elaine) – If they do this, what if their treatment interferes with our treatment? Reply (Jim) – If this board has a plan in place the DEQ will not issue individual herbicide permits.

Audience Comment – This community has some responsibility for how long this process has taken. Many wanted to keep going back to Hebron for approval, which went on for months. Pointing fingers and making threats to the board serves only to divide the community further and slows down the process. We should be cheering the board on.

Jennifer Jones – discussed how aeration is working on many lakes and announced that a study of Indian Lake will be released in December. She is working on her PHD and on this project and they are seeing a reduction in milfoil.

Marilyn Roll – There is now a monofilament collection site at the public access to collect old fishing line.

Cathy – Do we need the assessor to get started on the SAD? Answer (Tony) – I have most of the information now, but I will contact him.

Meeting adjourned.